DECISION



THE COMPTROLLER BENERAL OF THE UNITED STATES WABHINGTON, D.C. 20548

B-188922

FILE:

DATE: DEC 2 3 1977

DOD Military Pay and Allowance Committee MATTER OF:

Action No. 533

DIGEST:

- 1. A retired service member who validly elects into the Servivor Benefit Plan (SBP) may not volcatarily withdraw from the Plan and shall continue to have his retired pay reduced (10 U.S. C. 1452(a)) or make deposits for coverage (10 U. E. C. 1483(d)), if not entitled to retired pay, notwithstanding fact that member was subsequently employed in the Foreign Service, retired therefrom and elected a survivor ansaty under that system, This results from the absence of a provision in the SBP or other law comparable to 10 U. S. C. 1452(e) (applicable only to Civil Service mary: vor amounties) permitting termimation or suspension of SBP participation. Compare 55 Comp. Gen. 156 (1976).
- 2. A surviving spouse of retired military member, who validly elected into the SBP to provide spouse coverage and who later retired from the Foreign Service having validly elected spouse coverage under that retirement system, is entitled to payment of the Foreign Service survivor annuity as well as the elected ABP ensuity.

This action is in response to a letter from the Assistant Secretary of Defecte (Comptroller), requesting an advance decision (concerning the application of the Survivor Benefit Plan (SBP), 10 U.S.C. 1447-1455, in the case of a member retired from the armed forces and subsequently retired from the Foreign Service with a waiver of his military ratired pay so that his military service could be included in the computation of his Foreign Service assuity. A copy of Department of Defense Military Pay and Allowance Committee Action No. 536 was attached.

The situation described in the Committee Action involves a retired military member who validly elected SBP coverage for his apouse and thereafter was employed in the Foreign Service. Upon retirement from the Fureign Service, he elected to taive receipt of his military retired pay so that his military service could be included in the

computation of his Fereign Service ansatty. In addition, he elected to receive his Fereign Service ansatty in a reduced amount in order to provide survivor benefits for his spouse under the Fereign Service Retirement and Disability System, title VIII of the Fereign Service Act of 1946, approved August 13, 1946, ch. 967, 90 Stat. 963, 1948, as amounted, 22 U.S.C. 1961 et seq.

The specific questions asked are:

"I. Is the member required to make contributions to the Survivor Bouefit Fina as a result of the previsions of 10 U.S.C. 1452(d) after he waived his retired pay so that his military service could be included in the computation of his Foreign Survice equality?

"2. If the answer to question I is in the affirmative, would the surviving spouse of the member be entitled to receive both an anguly under the Surviver Bonefit Finn and under the Foreign Service Retirement System?"

The discussion in the Committee Action indicates that by virtue of the language contained in 10 U.S.C. 1/186(d), 1453(d); and 1453(e), there is a clear interface between the provisions of the EEF and the Civil Service survivor annuity plan. Under those provisions a retired service stember who elected EEF coverage he his spouse and who later waives receipt of military retired my for the purpose of including his military service time in the computation of his Civil Service cannot be declined such coverage. If the member declines Civil Service annuity coverage he retains SEF coverage lut must pay for it through deposits or into the Treasury of the United States.

The Committee Action points out that the survivor assuity provisions of the Foreign Service Retirement and Disability System, as amon'ed by the Foreign Service Retirement Amendments of 1976, Title V. Public Law 94-350, approved July 12, 1972, 90 Stat. 834, are generally parallel to and interface with the survivor atomity provisions of the Civil Sarvice Retirement System. However, the Committee Action goes on to point out that neither the survivor amusty provisions for Pereign Service retiress nor the SBP contains language establishing a similar interface relationship between those

B-126822

recurring Persign Service servicer establish is in augusted that the provision of 10 U.S.C. 1483(d), would require the manufer to easing to make deposite by SEP coverage even though he has unived receipt of his military retired pay in order to have his skillingy service establish the established of a Persign Rervice established with a coverage by Persign Service servicer established in the Constitute Action that a surviving spread of a retired service member who subsequently retired from the Parties in the circumstances described, might be estimated to both SEP and Foreign Service servicer manuface. This result is contrasted to the fact that a surviver manuface. This result is contrasted to the fact that a surviver may receive rely one cannot if the member was envered by SEP and the Civil Service servicer matality provides or was envered by a Civil Service servicer matality provides or was envered by a Civil Service

The Committee Action goes on to state that the Program analysis and exactuation is not without reportation, place the amendment adding subsection 505(a) to the Percit Service Act (28 U.S.C. 165(ch)) by section 505(a) of Public Law 54-350, engra, prohibits a marriving sprace from receiving a Percipa Service survivor antalty if seek appropriate to entitled to a survivor antalty from any other "retirement system for Government engityees."

wherether Artice Action points out that the difficulty in applying subsection Article to EEP survivor annalties is that members of the armed forces, active or retired, are not generally regarded as employees of the Government. Therefore, considerable doubt salets whether the REP should be regarded as a "retirement system for Government supplyces." It is stated that although the plain meaning of that section seems to support the conclusion of sampplicability, the legislative history of that provision indicates the purpose of that section to be general recognition of the possible payment of dual survivor annulties to a spouse, and limits receipt to only the higher of such Government unsulties, but not both at the same time. It is pointed out that since the only exemption from the required payment for EEP obverage is when the member elects to participate in the Civil Service survivor annulty plan, if only single survivor obverage is authorized, the member would have to continue REP coverage payments without the prospect of coverage and without possible retund of payments made.

B-186932

With regard to question L., it is noted that while the various survivor amulty plans available under Yederal law all have a common purpose and many parallel provisions, each plan is separate and distinct and must be an treated, except to the extent that certain of their respective provisions specifically provide otherwise.

If at the time a service member retires from military service, he validly elects into the SSP, unless the law governing SDP participation or provisions of some other law specifically permit termination or suspension of such participation, he may set voluntarily withdraw from the Flan, and shall continue to have his retired pay reduced (10 U.S.C. 1482(a)). Compare 55 Comp. Gen. 156 (1976).

In this connection, subsection 1468(d) of title 18, United Sintes Code, provides that:

"If a person who has elected to participate in the Plan has been awarded retired or retainer pay and is not entitled to that pay for any period, he must deposit in the Treasury the amount that would otherwise have been deducted from his pay for that period, except when he was called or ordered to active duty for a period of more than 30 days."

The only statutory exemption from the requirements of continued monthly coverage payments other than the member being recalled to active duty for more than 30 days, and the provisions for terminating deductions when there is no eligible beneficiary, is contained in 10 U.S.C. 1452(e). That subsection provides that when a member waives receipt of retired pay in order to use his military service for Civil Service annuity purposes and sleets a survivor annuity under that plan, "he shall not be required to make the deposit otherwise required by subsection (d) as long as that waiver is in effect * **."

Since we find no reference to retirements and survivor ammittees under the Foreign Service Retirement and Disability System in the SBP or its legislative Listory, it is our view that the retired member, having elected SBP spouse coverage is required to make deposite under the SBP pursuant to 10 U.S.C. 1452(d), even though he selectionally retires under the Foreign Service Retirement and Disability

11-120033

Appears and valves receipt of retired pay in order to receive a larger Pereign Service estably and also has surviver severage unfor that system. Accordingly, your first question is answered in the affirmative.

With regard to question 2., section 505(g) of Public Law 94-356, added subsection (h) to section 221 of the Fereign Service Act of 1646, 22 U.S.C. 1876(h), that provision is:

"(h) A perviving space shall not been an entitled to a survivor antitle of from the Fund [Fundings Service Retirement and Disability System) unless the survivor about to revolve it instead of any other survivor ansaty to which he or she may be estilled under this or any other retirement system for Government analysess."

It may be recognised that the term "employee" so used in connection with personnel in Government service does not usually include members of the services. The definitions in chapter 21 of title 5. United States Code, clearly limit that term to civilian personnel. See particularly 5 U.S.C. 256, 256, Also, the definitions in 10 U.S.C. 161 and 27 U.S.C. Mt. relating to the armed forces and may and allowances for the uniformed survices respectively, do not refer to personnel of the uniformed services as employees. Even the provisions of the Foreign dervice Ratirement and Disability System clearly distinguish between civilian employment and service in the uniformed services, 4.2., 25 U.S.C. 1688. On the other hand, the legislative history of the Foreign Service Retirement Aci Amendments of 1776 centains the statement at page 41 of House Conference Report No. 54-1268 that:

"Morentor, the spouse of a retires may receive the higher of two Government survivor assettion but not both structuresurily."

Although the quoted statement may be viewed as indicating that the amendment adding section \$31(h) to the Fereign Service Act of 1948 was not intended to be restricted to survivor associates based on civilian service, we are faced with the problem that, as indicated above, SEP contributions must be made by a retiree even though he has survivor benefit protection under the Fereign Service Retirement

.1-186932

System. If we were to held that survivers are us; estitled to SSF Sensitie, payment of the member after his retirement from the Pereign Service would be required although so baselt would accrue to his survivers as a result thereof. In view thereof and since the term "employee" is used in the statute in question, we are inclined to the view that receipt of surviver benefits under the Pereign Service Retirement and Disability System does not preclude payment of an SBF annuity even though the retiree's military pervise was used in computing his annuity and his surviver's annuity under the Poreign Service Retirement and Disability System. Accordingly, question 2 is answered in the affirmative.

R.P. PELLER

. Deputy Comptrailer General of the United States